1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	"Lost to the NHS" – Why GPs leave practice early: a mixed methods
8	study
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	• Dr Natasha Doran, Honorary Research Fellow, Department for Health, University of
18	Bath, UK
19	• Dr Fiona Fox, Research Associate, NIHR Collaborations for Leadership in Applied Health
20	Research and Care (CLAHRC) West, University of Bristol, UK
21	<ul> <li>Prof Karen Rodham, Professor of Health Psychology, Staffordshire University, UK</li> </ul>
22	• Dr Gordon Taylor, Reader in Medical Statistics, Department for Health, University of
23	Bath, UK
24	• Dr Michael Harris, Visiting Senior Research Fellow, Department for Health, University of
25	Bath, UK
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	Corresponding author
31	Natasha Doran BA MA Ph.D., Research Fellow, Department for Health, University of Bath,
32	Claverton Down, Bath, BA2 7AY, United Kingdom
33	E-mail: N.Doran@bath.ac.uk
34	
35	
36	
37	
38	
39	
40	
41	
42	
43	

#### 44 Abstract

45

- 46 Background
- 47 The early loss of GPs is contributing to the GP workforce crisis. Recruitment in the United
- 48 Kingdom remains below the numbers needed to support demand for GP care.
- 49 Aim
- 50 To explore the reasons why GPs leave practice early
- 51 Design and Setting
- 52 A mixed methods study using online survey data triangulated with qualitative interviews.
- 53 Method
- 54 Participants were GPs who had left the English Medical Performers List in the last five years
- (2009 -2014), whilst under 50 years of age. 143 early GP leavers participated in an online
- survey, of which 21 took part in a recorded telephone interview. Survey data were analysed
- 57 using descriptive statistics, and qualitative data using thematic analysis techniques.
- 58 Results
- 59 Reasons for leaving were cumulative and multifactorial. Organisational changes to the National
- 60 Health Service have led to an increase in administrative tasks and overall workload, which is
- 61 perceived by GP participants to have fundamentally changed the doctor-patient relationship.
- 62 Lack of time with patients has compromised the ability to practise more patient-centred care,
- and with it, GPs' sense of professional autonomy and values, resulting in diminished job
- 64 satisfaction. Once their job satisfaction had become negatively impacted, the combined
- 65 pressures of increased patient demand and the negative media portrayal left many feeling
- 66 unsupported and vulnerable to burnout and ill health, and ultimately, the decision to leave
- 67 general practice.
- 68 Conclusion
- To improve retention of young GPs, the pace of administrative change needs to be minimised
- and the time spent by GPs on work that is not face-to-face patient care reduced.
- 71 Keywords
- 72 General practice; qualitative research; job satisfaction; professional autonomy

#### 

#### 74 How this fits in

75 Almost half of GP leavers in England are younger than 50

76 Key drivers for leaving early relate to changes in the National Health Service, resulting in loss of

- 77 professional autonomy, and in overwork, stress and burnout.
- 78 UK general practice has undergone a series of organisational changes resulting in an increase in
- 79 day-to-day administrative tasks which have come to negatively impact the doctor-patient
- 80 relationship. To improve retention of young GPs in practice, time spent on work that is not face-
- 81 to-face patient care needs to be minimised.

#### 98 Introduction

- 99 It has been the policy of successive United Kingdom (UK) governments to address the challenge
- 100 of the growing healthcare needs of the ageing population by transferring care into primary and
- 101 community settings (1). In the ten years prior to 2011, the General Practitioner (GP) workforce
- in the UK had an annual average increase of 2.3% (2). However, this was only half the rate of
- 103 other medical specialties (3). Patient demand for GP services in England continues to grow, with
- an estimated 340 million patient consultations per year, an increase of 40 million since 2008
- 105 (3). The UK Department of Health (DH) has set a target that half of all medical graduates
- 106 entering postgraduate specialty training should go into General Practitioner training (4).
- 107 However, despite the longstanding DH policy to increase GP training numbers in England to
- 108 3,250 per annum, GP recruitment has remained below this target, at around 2,700 per annum
- (5). The cost of five years Foundation and GP training programmes is £249,261 per GP (6). It is
- 110 therefore imperative that these highly trained professionals are retained within the UK primary
- 111 care workforce.
- Between 2009 and 2014, 45.5% of GP leavers were younger than 50, while 30.6% were aged
- between 50 and 59, and less than a quarter were aged 60 or over (7). This early loss of GPs is
- 114 contributing to the GP workforce crisis (8). In 2013, the NHS Executive and NHS England
- 115 commissioned this mixed-methods study to investigate why so many GPs leave the National
- 116 Health Service (NHS) below the age of 50 (9, 10). This article is a summary of the main reasons
- 117 for leaving.

#### 118 Method

#### 119 Study design

- 120 A mixed method study comprising an online survey, triangulated with qualitative interviews,
- 121 was conducted. To design the survey, the views of 34 GPs were sought. From these, FF used
- 122 qualitative content analysis to identify major categories, which then formed the survey items
- 123 (9).

#### 124 Survey recruitment

- 125 GPs who had left the English Medical Performer's List (MPL) between 2009 and 2014 whilst
- 126 under 50 years of age were recruited through articles in BMA News as well as direct mailing.
- 127 Twelve NHS Area Teams (ATs), between them covering 40% of the population of England sent
- invitations to some or all of their early GP leavers. In total, ATs mailed 413 early leavers, and
- 129 143 participated in the online survey.

#### 130 Qualitative interviews recruitment

- 131 At the end of the online survey, participants were invited to take part in an interview and 38
- 132 survey participants volunteered. Of these, 21 returned signed consent forms. Semi-structured
- 133 interviews were carried out by telephone, guided by an interview schedule that was developed
- to complement and extend the survey questions. (10) Interviews lasting between 40 and 60
- 135 minutes, were audio recorded, transcribed verbatim and all identifying information was
- 136 removed.

#### 137 Analysis

- 138 **Quantitative:** Survey data were analysed using descriptive statistics (MH). Common themes
- 139 were identified and summarized from the free response survey items (FF) using thematic
- 140 analysis techniques (11).
- 141 **Qualitative:** Fieldwork notes contextualised the interview data and detailed summaries of each
- 142 interview were produced. Thematic analysis was used to generate themes, both within and
- across the dataset (11). The phases of analysis included coding, followed by the identification
- and clustering of themes and sub themes and the production of a descriptive thematic
- summary (ND). Team members (ND, FF, KR) each coded three transcripts, before comparing
- 146 their analyses for inconsistencies and agreement. Finally the themes and sub themes were
- 147 grouped to construct a more interpretative narrative across the dataset and depicted
- 148 diagrammatically (ND) Figure 1.

#### 149 Results

- 150 Of the 143 survey participants, 72 (50.3%) were female and 70 (49.0%) male (one unknown).
- 151 Their median age range was 40-44 years. Of the 21 interviewees, 14 participants were female
- and seven were male, with an age range of 32 to 54 years at time of interview. They had been
- practising GPs in the UK for between 2.5 and 20 years; their ages when they left general
- 154 practice in England ranged from 29 to 50 years. Participants represented a maximum variation
- sample in terms of age, number of years as practising GPs, and geographical location.
- 156 While many of the categories in the survey were also identified in the analysis of the qualitative
- 157 interviews, the inductive and interpretative nature of the qualitative analysis generated a
- 158 thematic summary which illustrates the complex and overlapping issues causing GPs to leave
- 159 practice early (see Figure 1). The qualitative findings are therefore given primacy here and are
- 160 supported by relevant statistical evidence from the survey.
- 161 All survey respondents indicated that they had left English general practice for multiple reasons
- 162 (9):

- 163 "I think it's so multi-factorial, I don't think there's any one thing. I think it's that combination of
- 164 *increased work with decreasing income with high patient expectation with continuous media*
- 165 negativity and no support from the government, just all of those things." (GP5)
- 166 This complex interplay of factors explaining why GPs leave practice early was encapsulated by
- 167 the overarching theme 'changing role of general practice and its impact'. This is discussed in
- relation to the sub-themes: organisational changes; clash of values; increased workload;
- 169 negative media portrayal; workplace issues and lack of support.

# 170 **1. Organisational changes**

- 171 Participants described a radically altered working environment caused by an unprecedented
- increase in organisational changes, many of which were felt to be made without "long-term
- vision" (GP19) and for "little health gain." (GP15) Unhappiness with day to day life as a GP was
- indicated by 79% of survey respondents, in particular changes to the role of the GP 44%:
- 175 "Cases were getting more complicated, more was being transferred from the responsibility of
- the hospital to the responsibility of GPs and I found that even in the short time I had, I was
- spending more and more time doing administrative things and less and less time being able to
- devote my mental attention to the patients in front of me. I just felt more and more stretched."
- 179 (GP3)
- 180 As referral systems became more complex and hospitals more specialised, interviewees
- 181 experienced a more fragmented and depersonalised healthcare system that was increasingly
- 182 challenging for them to navigate:
- 183 "One of the problems with hospital medicine is it's very fragmented and everyone is so super
- 184 specialist that they aren't the generalists that they used to be, so if you sent somebody in with
- one thing, they have that sorted, but they don't look at the bigger picture, so they'd come back
- 186 out and there'd be another thing that was developing so you'd have to refer them to
- 187 somewhere else, so the fragmented nature of hospital medicine makes general practice quite
  188 difficult." (GP4)

# 189 **2.** Clash of values

- 190 According to participants, continual organisational changes fundamentally altered their
- 191 professional role to a "government clerk" or a "data clerk for public health and for
- 192 management." (GP15) The increasing influx of administrative tasks left many feeling
- 193 professionally compromised as they came to face conflicting priorities in the consulting room.
- 194 55.6% of survey respondents stated that the goalposts were being moved too often and 52.1%
- 195 disliked the "target-driven" approach to patient care:

- 196 *"Some of it was helpful, but some of it was just administrative for administrative sake. You*
- spent more time ticking boxes than you did talking to the patients sometimes [...] that put more
- stress on me and I felt it affected my rapport with the patients." (GP2)
- 199 For most participants, the introduction of the Quality Outline Framework (QOF) marked a
- 200 defining point where "modern medicine" became a "more target driven culture" (GP12), or a
- 201 'tick box exercise'". (GP1)
- For the majority of participants, attempts to juggle what they saw as "impossible targets" with "unrealistic appointment times" (GP12) detracted from delivering good patient care:
- 204 *"The partner would come in before I started surgery and say, 'Oh don't forget to do all the QOFs*
- 205 [...] we've got QOFs on target [..] And that was more important than actually focusing on the
- 206 patient [...] With busier and busier surgeries with more and more extras, something has to go
- 207 and I think what ends up going when you're under pressure to get all the QOFs and the money
- 208 *in, is the actual patient relationship." (GP11)*

## 209 3. Increased workload

- 210 Participants perceived that management targets, regulations and guidelines impinged on their
- 211 day-to-day work in general practice, increasing their workload. 50.0% of survey respondents
- thought that the non-clinical workload was too high, while 83.8% said that aspects relating to
- 213 pressure of work featured in their decision to leave practice early.
- 214 "The consultation's length didn't change, but what you were expected to do in a consultation
  215 changed" (GP11)
- 216 *"I felt I was cutting corners, I felt I wasn't offering a good service unfortunately." (GP6)*
- The higher administrative workload reduced the time available to spend with their patients, leading to a fundamental change in the doctor-patient relationship:
- 219 "You see it does change the doctor-patient relationship because it changes how you react to
- 220 people and how you interact with people. I mean it's obvious stuff, but when you're really
- stressed and you've still got fifteen people to see, you don't have the time for people, you don't
- 222 have the interest". (GP11)
- The conditions within which doctors were expected to function affected their ability to practise holistic, patient centred care:
- 225 "Patients are dissatisfied [...] because they're not being given sufficient time to give their history
- properly and be investigated at the primary care level [...] there isn't that reflective quality that

- allows differential diagnosis, use of time, the use of your personal knowledge of the individual
  and their social circumstances to be applied." (GP9)
- 229 With more work shifting from hospital to primary care combined with changes in patient
- 230 population and demand, participants felt increasingly time stretched. Strategies to cope
- 231 included staying late at work, taking work home, or changing their appointment times:
- 232 *"I changed my work patterns because I kept getting migraine headaches, because I was getting*
- stressed because of time pressures [...] I found it very stressful, having patients just waiting,
- 234 because I was running late on a regular basis" (GP2)
- 235 4. Negative media portrayal
- Factors relating to patients and the media were cited by 63% of survey respondents. Concerns
- about media attacks on the medical profession were indicated more frequently (57%) than fear
   of litigation (25%) or complaints (18%).
- Rather than feeling supported in their efforts to meet patient demands, or to cope with the
- pressures inherent in a high-risk working environment, participants instead felt worn down by
   negative media representations:
- 242 "I was very conscious of the negative image of general practice in the media and I found it quite
  243 stressful" (GP3)
- Not only did participants feel misrepresented by "political spin", but they felt frustrated that the more positive aspects of their hard work and professionalism went largely unreported:
- 246 *"there was never anything positive, never any positive health stories related to the improvement*
- 247 in cardiac mortality, reductions in cancer deaths, earlier diagnosis any of the positives that
- 248 we'd achieved were just ignored." (GP9)
- 249 "One of the frustrations is that I think there was definitely a political spin against general
- 250 practice [...] It doesn't help when you've had a bad day at work and you come home and watch
- 251 the ten o'clock news and you see somebody on the telly saying 'Oh these GPs aren't working
- very hard and patients can never get appointments' [....] Just constant criticism in the press
- about the fact that GPs were getting paid an awful lot of money and they weren't having to do
- 254 the out-of-hours and they weren't working nights and weekends." (GP6)
- 255 For many participants, being portrayed as "overpaid and under delivering" was tantamount to
- <sup>256</sup> "media battering". Being the subject of an on-going and negative media campaign left many
- 257 feeling undermined and demoralised:

258 *"We were targeted in a completely unsympathetic light [...] without any recognition of what as* 259 *a profession we gave to the public really and it did, over time, become very wearing" (GP9)* 

# 260 5. Workplace issues and lack of support

Participants described conflicts within their practices over funding, career progression, flexible hours and workload distribution. These issues within practices were exacerbated by the lack of time for more informal interactions and support among colleagues. While all participants felt supported during their training and registrar year, once fully qualified they became increasingly isolated in practice:

266 *"I did sometimes feel quite isolated at the practice [...] I think the thing that possibly my training* 

267 hadn't prepared me for was sort of feeling like a lone worker in many ways, particularly in

268 comparison to working in a hospital where you were always part of a team." (GP3)

- Participants expressed the view that more was being expected of them by government, withoutthe necessary support in place:
- 271 *"I lost my confidence. I lost my faith in the system. I lost my faith in my profession [...] I think*
- 272 once you've lost your confidence, then I don't think there's any structure within the profession
- 273 that helps that come back." (GP4)
- Participants described a "bullying culture", which they felt had come to permeate the NHS fromthe top down:
- 276 "There is a really aggressive, vicious, bullying culture that permeates management in the
- 277 National Health Service. That then flows all the way down to whoever your locality middle
- 278 managers are. It's a dreadful, awful, bullying culture and to shift from that to a non-overseeing,
- 279 facilitative, hands-off, trusting culture is, ... I don't know if people are capable of that cultural
- 280 shift." (GP15)
- Unhappiness with their professional culture was important for 61% of survey respondents, inparticular the feeling of a loss of autonomy and professional control 44%.
- 283 Several participants expressed the need for more support, particularly in the form of a more
- 284 "robust" occupational health service for doctors.
- 285 6. Impact on job satisfaction and well-being
- 286 Time pressure and conflicting priorities meant that participants felt that the care they were
- 287 giving was sub-standard. These pressures, intensified by a perceived "blame culture", led to
- disillusionment and a raised anxiety about the risk of making a mistake.

- 289 *"I found that I was increasingly anxious about the patients that I was seeing. I think because I*
- 290 was so often quite time-strapped with all the things that I was trying to fit in during the day. But
- 291 I felt conscious that I was worried that I ran the risk of missing things and that made me really
- 292 worried and anxious." (GP3)
- 293 Participants described a series of conditions which they felt contributed to an increasingly
- 294 pressurised working environment. These included organisational changes resulting in a clash of
- values and diminishing professional autonomy as health-care became more centralised,
- standardised and depersonalised; an unprecedented increase in administrative workload; and a
- 297 lack of support not only from government, but across services and the wider community due to
- an ongoing negative media campaign:

### 299 FIGURE 1 [Insert diagram here]

- 300 This combination of factors led to reduced job satisfaction and ultimately affected well-being.
- 301 In some cases participants came to hate their job:
- "I think I got to the point where I hated it and, that's a really strong word. But I absolutely hated
  it and I used to wake up on a Friday morning feeling sick at the thought of going in." (GP11)
- In other cases, it was not so much the job, but "everything around the job" which they came to"hate" as another participant described:
- "Passionately adoring my work and my patients, I mean, really I can't tell you how much I miss
   them. Absolutely loved the actual job, but everything around the job I hated." (GP7)
- 308 One participant, who had worked in general practice for 18 years and was also an appraiser, 309 described the impact this was having on a number of GPs:
- 310 "There was this kind of malaise growing within the profession that I could see as an appraiser.
- As GP's got more and more exhausted and burnt out, there was this 'I don't want to know,'
- 312 there was this disassociation, there was this lack of will to fight to get what patients needed"
- 313 *(GP13)*
- A third of the survey sample experienced ill health, including stress and anxiety disorder.
- Burnout was cited by 38% of the survey respondents, although some participants self-
- 316 diagnosed the early symptoms of burnout:
- 317 *"I don't think I was medically ill, but I was certainly quite grumpy and I was quite fed up and I*
- just wasn't enjoying work and I got to the stage when I was driving to work and I used to have
- 319 this sort of sense of dread the nearer I got to the practice and I thought 'Oh no, another day is
- 320 coming'. I thought this isn't right, I shouldn't be feeling like this!"(GP6)

- 321 Others decided to act upon these early warning signs and leave:
- 322 "Before getting to the point where I really thought I was going to burnout and really hit a very
- low point mentally and psychologically, I thought actually, I think I recognised those warning
- 324 signs and I thought it better to go do something different at this point whilst I still have the
- 325 wherewithal to go and do it." (GP12)
- 326 Personal factors were cited by 91% of respondents, in particular feeling overworked (54%), a
- 327 wish to improve their work/life balance (49%), the work being too stressful (43%) and lack of
- 328 enjoyment of the work (42%).
- 329 Overall participants felt that their job was not meeting expectations particularly among GPs
- 330 who had been in practice for 10 years or more, it was felt that their current job was
- unrecognisable from the professional role they had initially taken on.

#### 332 Discussion

#### 333 Summary

- Participants had been attracted to GP work in the expectation that it would offer continuity of
- patient care, professional autonomy and flexibility in working hours, along with the intellectual
- challenge inherent in problem solving. However, participants described factors that were both
- 337 cumulative and multifactorial, leading to their decision to leave practice early in their careers
- 338 (see Figure 1).
- 339 The extent and rapidity of organisational changes to the NHS, which had led to an increase in
- 340 day-to-day administrative tasks and overall workload, was perceived by participants to have
- fundamentally changed the doctor-patient relationship the very hallmark of general practice.
- Lack of time with patients meant the ability to practice patient-centred continuity of care was
- 343 perceived to be compromised and, with it, the GPs' professional autonomy and values,
- 344 resulting in diminished job satisfaction. Once their job satisfaction had become negatively
- impacted, the combined pressures of increased patient demand and the negative media
- portrayal left many feeling unsupported and vulnerable to burnout and ill health, and
- 347 ultimately, the decision to leave general practice.

#### 348 Strengths and limitations

- 349 UK GP training, recruitment and retention is fast approaching crisis as more GPs leave the
- 350 profession at younger ages. This study triangulates interview findings with survey results to
- 351 provide an in-depth exploration of the reasons why this is happening. We acknowledge that
- 352 participants were self-selecting and therefore might have had particularly strong views.

However, interviewees represented a maximum variation sample in terms of age, number of years as practising GPs, and geographical location.

#### 355 **Comparison with existing literature**

356 Although current evidence points to an impending crisis in the recruitment and retention of 357 general practitioners in the UK (12-14), this is by no means a new phenomenon (15-17), nor one 358 which is unique to the UK workforce (18-20). In 2001, a survey carried out by the BMA revealed that a guarter of GPs wanted to guit (21), while a number of surveys, carried out before and 359 360 since, have continued to monitor GP training, retention and recruitment, particularly in relation to contractual reforms, job satisfaction and burnout (15, 22-26). Much research has been 361 362 carried out on factors associated with stress, anxiety, depression and burnout among doctors in the UK and abroad (27-30). There has also been a renewed focus in the research literature upon 363 364 educational initiatives, preventative measures and therapeutic interventions which could be 365 taken to help combat what is perceived to be a growing malaise within the health care

- 366 profession (31-35).
- In a recent BMA survey, 80% of 1000 respondents rated work pressure as "high or very high",
- 368 with their main workplace stresses being "meeting patients' demands, lack of time and
- 369 excessive bureaucracy" (36). In a study looking at motives for early retirement among GPs in
- 370 the Netherlands, policies related to workload reduction were considered the most useful
- instruments to control retention and retirement (37). Our mixed methods study complements
- 372 and extends this literature, by showing the cumulative, inter-related and multi-factorial reasons
- as to why GPs are leaving practice early in their careers.

### 374 Implications for research and/or practice

- 375 The early loss of GPs causes a considerable drain on NHS resources. To improve retention of
- 376 GPs in practice, NHS leaders need both to minimise the pace of administrative change and to
- 377 reduce the amount of time spent by GPs on work that is not face-to-face patient care.
- For those leaving practice early, exit interviews would help identify specific local as well asmore general reasons for loss to the GP workforce.
- 380 Many GPs reported that they had enjoyed direct patient care. Research is needed on how the
- 381 skills and experience of GPs can most usefully be harnessed, rather than being lost to the NHS.

#### 382 Figure 1

383 Boiling Frogs - The Changing Role of General Practice and its Impact'

#### 384 Additional information

- 385 Funding
- 386 The study was jointly funded by NHS England and the Health Education Authority
- 387 Ethical approval
- 388 Ethical approval was granted by the Research Ethics Approval Committee for Health (REACH) at
- the University of Bath. (REACH reference number: EP 13/1451).

#### 390 Competing interests

- 391 The funding sources had no involvement in, or influence on, the study. The authors have
- 392 declared no competing interests.

#### 393 Acknowledgements

- 394 The authors would like to thank all volunteer participants who kindly gave their time to share
- their experiences of working in UK general practice. We also wish to thank Justin Devine for hisgraphic design work.

397			
398			
399			
400			
401			
402			
403			
404			
405			
406			
407			
408			
409			
410			

#### 411 References 412 Department of Health. The new NHS: Modern, dependable. The Stationery Office; 1997. 1. 2. 413 The Health and Social Care Information Centre Workforce Directorate. General and Personal 414 Medical Services England 2001 - 2011 The Health and Social Care Information Centre; 2012. 415 3. NHS England Analytical Service. Improving General Practice – a call to action. Evidence pack. NHS England; 2014. Available from http://www.england.nhs.uk/wp-416 417 content/uploads/2013/09/igp-cta-evid.pdf. NHS Careers. Careers in medicine: General practice: National Health Service; 2015 [23 March 418 4. 419 2015]. Available from: http://www.nhscareers.nhs.uk/explore-by-career/doctors/careers-in-420 medicine/general-practice/. 421 5. GP Taskforce. Securing the Future GP Workforce Delivering the Mandate on GP Expansion: GP 422 Taskforce Final Report. National Health Service; 2014. 423 Curtis L. Unit Costs of Health and Social Care 2014. Canterbury: 2014. 6. Health and Social Care Information Centre. General Practice Bulletin Tables 2004 - 2014 Medical 424 7. 425 Services, England; 2015. Available from http://www.hscic.gov.uk/catalogue/PUB16934. 426 8. BMA. Survey reveals extent of GP workforce crisis 2014 [30 March 2015]. Available from: 427 http://bma.org.uk/news-views-analysis/news/2014/may/survey-reveals-extent-of-gp-428 workforce-crWoSs. 429 9. Doran N, Fox F, Rodham K, et al. Early GP Leavers Interim Report. University of Bath, 2014. 430 10. Doran N, Fox F, Rodham K, et al. A qualitative study exploring the reasons why GP's leave 431 practice early in their careers and the barriers to their return. Final Report. University of Bath, 432 2014. 433 11. Braun V, Clarke V. Using thematic analysis in psychology. Qualitative Research in Psychology. 434 2006;3(2):77-101. 435 12. Adams S. NHS facing GP workforce crisis. Telegraph. 2013 27th February. BMA. General practice faces 'serious threat' to recruitment. BMA. 2014. 436 13. BMA. Survey reveals extent of GP workforce crisis. BMA. 2014. 437 14. 438 Young R, Leese B. Recruitment and retention of general practitioners in the UK: what are the 15. 439 problems and solutions? Br J Gen Pract: JR Coll Gen Pract. 1999;49(447):829-33. 440 16. Lambert TW, Evans J, Goldacre MJ. Recruitment of UK-trained doctors into general practice: 441 findings from national cohort studies. Br J Gen Pract: JR Coll Gen Pract. 2002;52(478):364-7, 9-442 72. 443 17. Evans J, Lambert T, Goldacre M. GP recruitment and retention: a qualitative analysis of doctors' 444 comments about training for and working in general practice. Occas Pap R Coll Gen Pract. 445 2002(83):iii-vi, 1-33. 446 18. Sumanen M, Aine T, Halila H, et al. Where have all the GPs gone--where will they go? Study of Finnish GPs. BMC Fam Pract. 2012;13:121. 447 448 19. Heponiemi T, Manderbacka K, Vanska J, Elovainio M. Can organizational justice help the 449 retention of general practitioners? Health Policy (Amsterdam, Netherlands). 2013;110(1):22-8.

450 20. Van Greuningen M, Heiligers PJ, Van der Velden LF. Motives for early retirement of self-451 employed GPs in the Netherlands: a comparison of two time periods. BMC health services 452 research. 2012;12:467. 453 21. Kmietowicz Z. Quarter of GPs want to quit, BMA survey shows. BMJ. 2001;323(7318):887. 454 22. Sibbald B, Enzer I, Cooper C, et al. GP job satisfaction in 1987, 1990 and 1998: lessons for the 455 future? Fam Pract. 2000;17(5):364-71. 456 23. Van Ham I, Verhoeven AA, Groenier KH, et al. Job satisfaction among general practitioners: a 457 systematic literature review. Eur J Gen Pract. 2006;12(4):174-80. 458 24. Watson J, Humphrey A, Peters-Klimm F, Hamilton W. Motivation and satisfaction in GP training: 459 a UK cross-sectional survey. Br J Gen Pract: JR Coll Gen Pract. 2011;61(591):e645-9. 460 25. Whalley D, Bojke C, Gravelle H, Sibbald B. GP job satisfaction in view of contract reform: a national survey. Br J Gen Pract: JR Coll Gen Pract. 2006;56(523):87-92. 461 462 26. Sibbald B, Bojke C, Gravelle H. National survey of job satisfaction and retirement intentions 463 among general practitioners in England. BMJ. 2003;326(7379):22. 464 27. McManus IC, Winder BC, Gordon D. The causal links between stress and burnout in a 465 longitudinal study of UK doctors. Lancet. 2002;359(9323):2089-90. Vedsted P, Sokolowski I, Olesen F. Open Access to General Practice Was Associated with 466 28. 467 Burnout among General Practitioners. Int J Family Med. 2013;2013:383602. 468 29. Firth-Cozens J. Individual and organizational predictors of depression in general practitioners. Br 469 J Gen Pract. 1998;48(435):1647-51. 470 30. Harvey SB, Laird B, Henderson M, Hotopf M. The mental health of health care professionals: A 471 review for the Department of Health. In: Health Do, editor. London 2009. 472 31. Kjeldmand D, Holmstrom I. Balint groups as a means to increase job satisfaction and prevent 473 burnout among general practitioners. Ann Fam Med. 2008;6(2):138-45. 474 32. Lown BA, Manning CF. The Schwartz Center Rounds: evaluation of an interdisciplinary approach 475 to enhancing patient-centered communication, teamwork, and provider support. Acad Med. 476 2010;85(6):1073-81. 477 33. Krasner MS, Epstein RM, Beckman H, et al. Association of an educational program in mindful 478 communication with burnout, empathy, and attitudes among primary care physicians. JAMA. 479 2009;302(12):1284-93. 480 34. Beckman HB, Wendland M, Mooney C, et al. The impact of a program in mindful communication 481 on primary care physicians. Acad Med. 2012;87(6):815-9. 482 35. Bullock A, Fox F, Barnes R, et al. Transitions in medicine: trainee doctor stress and support 483 mechanisms. Journal of Workplace Learning. 2013;25(6):368-82. 484 36. Jaques H. BMA must "act now" on stress and burnout, say doctors. BMJ Careers. 2013. 485 37. Van Greuningen M, Heiligers PJ, Van der Velden LF. Motives for early retirement of self-486 employed GPs in the Netherlands: a comparison of two time periods. BMC Health Serv Res. 487 2012;12:467.(doi):10.1186/472-6963-12-467. 488 489

# "Boiling **Frogs**"

# The changing role of general practice and its impact

"If you take a frog and you stick it in some very hot water it will jump out, it won't like it. If you take the same frog and you stick it in a pan full of water and you just very, very slowly warm it up, it will adapt to the change, to the point that [...] you can actually boil the water and [...] because it's so well used to adapting, it won't realise that it's actually dying!" (GP6)

"A lot of GP meetings that I used to go to they used to go on about "boiling frogs" and they said they keep on increasing the workload on GPs who are adapting to the point where they all crack and then say "That's it, I've had enough!" (GP6)

> 4. **NEGATIVE MEDIA PORTRAYAL** • Fear of "political spin"

• Portrayed as "overpaid and under delivering" • Undermining/ demoralising

#### 3. **INCREASED** WORKLOAD

• More bureaucracy management targets, regulations and guidelines More work shifting from hospital to primary care

• Change in patient population and demand

• Time pressures

#### 6. IMPACT ON WELL-BEING

- Ill-health including stress/anxiety/ burn out
- Poor work/life balance

#### LOW JOB SATISFACTION

- Feeling undervalued and under appreciated
- No time for reflection
- Loss of intellectual challenge
- Having to cut corners
- Burdened by conflicting priorities
- Feel no longer giving a good service (impact on quality and continuity of patient care
- Losing confidence with regards competency
- Fearing litigation/practising defensively
- More stress, time pressures and administrative tasks
- Continuity of patient care not as expected
- Current job unrecognisable from the professional role they took on
- Job not meeting expectations

#### 5. WORKPLACE **ISSUES AND LACK OF SUPPORT**

- Partnership conflicts over workload/ flexible hours/funding/career progression Colleagues - less time for informal support or "catch up"
  - Feeling more isolated in practice
    - Bullying culture • Need for a more "robust"
- occupational health service • Government - more expected of GPs
- with less financial resources and support in place





#### **LEAVING UK GENERAL PRACTICE**

- Relocating abroad
- Changing jobs
- Early retirement on medical grounds

#### 1. ORGANISATIONAL **CHANGES**

 Hospitals becoming more specialised Changes to methods of referral/ more complex communication channels across services • Funding cuts

• More standardised. depersonalised, fragmented patient care

#### 2. **CLASH OF VALUES**

 Reduced to "government clerks" Impossible targets • Unrealistic

appointment times Less patient centred